06, 2010 (Case Brief / Digest)

Title: Cuaki Tan Si vs. Republic of the Philippines

### Facts:

- Cuaki Tan Si, a Chinese national, applied for naturalization as a Philippine citizen before the Court of First Instance of Davao on September 2, 1958, claiming to have resided in the Philippines since May 11, 1926.
- The Solicitor General and the Provincial Fiscal of Davao opposed Cuaki's petition, raising concerns about his qualifications and the compliance with formal requirements for naturalization.
- Cuaki relied on two character witnesses—Gregorio S. Romero, who had known him since 1937, and Celestino Ceniza—to vouch for his good character and lack of disqualifications as per Commonwealth Act No. 473.
- The Court of First Instance ruled in favor of Cuaki Tan Si, granting him citizenship.
- The Provincial Fiscal of Davao appealed the decision to the Supreme Court on the grounds of insufficient credible evidence provided by character witnesses regarding Cuaki's qualifications.
- The Solicitor General, after reviewing the evidence, filed a manifestation with the Supreme Court to withdraw the appeal, suggesting Cuaki had met the legal qualifications.
- The Supreme Court chose to consider the manifestation as appellant's brief and requested Cuaki to submit his brief as well.

#### **Issues:**

- Whether Cuaki Tan Si met the qualifications for naturalization, specifically through credible character witnesses as required by law.
- Whether the character witnesses provided sufficiently credible and comprehensive testimony regarding his moral character and qualifications.

# Court's Decision:

- The Supreme Court determined that naturalization requirements are stringent as it affects national interest and public order. The applicant must meet both substantial and procedural prerequisites as set by Commonwealth Act No. 473.
- It was found that one character witness, Gregorio S. Romero, was only acquainted with Cuaki for less than the required thirty-year duration, and lacked knowledge about Cuaki's beliefs regarding violence and political principles.
- The second witness, Celestino Ceniza, showed ignorance of specific statutory disqualifications and was uncertain about Cuaki's political principles and personal details.
- The Court concluded the character witnesses did not provide adequate assurance or

A.M. No. RTJ-10-2242 FORMERLY OCA IPI NO. 09-3149-RTJ. August

intimate knowledge of Cuaki's qualifications and statutory disqualifications.

- The decision of the Court of First Instance was reversed, denying Cuaki Tan Si's petition for naturalization.

#### Doctrine:

- Naturalization is a privilege, not a right, requiring rigorous adherence to both substantial and procedural conditions.
- Personal knowledge and credibility of character witnesses must be adequately established; witnesses essentially insure the applicant's character (Ong v. Republic, Cu v. Republic, Lim Ching Tian v. Republic).
- On failure to establish credible character witnesses as required, petitions must be denied.

## Class Notes:

- Naturalization under Commonwealth Act No. 473 requires both substantial qualifications (absence of disqualifications) and compliance with procedural norms (filing of a declaration of intention, credible character witnesses).
- "Credible persons" must know the applicant personally and can attest to no disqualifications or questionable moral character.
- Statutory provisions: Commonwealth Act No. 473, Sect. 6 Residence exemption; Sect. 7 Requirements for character witnesses.
- Application: Inadequate personal acquaintance or cursory understanding of disqualifications results in dismissal.

# Historical Background:

- During the mid-20th century, post-war Philippines experienced an influx of immigrants seeking citizenship, prompting stringent naturalization laws to ensure the integration of applicants aligned with Philippine values and governance structures.
- The case reflects the heightened scrutiny applied to naturalization cases amidst efforts to establish national identity and sovereignty while balancing openness to immigrants.