

**ILOCOS NORTE COCONUT PRODUCERS ASSOCIATION INC.,
PETITIONER, VS. JOHN F. NORTHCOTT, JR. & ROBERT PATRICK
NORTH-COTT, RESPONDENTS.**

G.R. No. L-31623. September 25, 1979

Ponente: MELENCIO-HERRERA, J.

Read online (full-text search, related cases, audio case brief): <https://batas.org/library/2182b35dd46b/>

MELENCIO-HERRERA, J.:

This is a Petition for Review on Certiorari of the Amended Decision of the Court of First Instance of Ilocos Norte, at Laoag City, in its Civil Case No. 4235, declaring valid the redemption made by respondents, John F. Northcott, Jr. and Robert Patrick Northcott, of a parcel of land purchased by petitioner, Ilocos Norte Coconut Producers Association, Inc., at a public auction sale for tax delinquency. This Petition docketed as G.R. No. L- 31623, was filed on March 11, 1970 by petitioner through Atty. Eustaquio Bumanlag. The Petition prayed that the Amended Decision of the lower Court be reversed for lack of jurisdiction and abuse of discretion. The Petition was given due course on March 13, 1970.[1]

The records disclose that on March 6, 1970, another similar Petition for Review on Certiorari of the same Amended Decision was filed by Attys. Hermenigildo A. Prieto and Antonio Foronda, on behalf of petitioner and others, this time docketed as G. R. No. L-31865, entitled:

PEDRO CABILDO, as Provincial Treasurer, Ilocos Norte, ADOLFO CALAPINI, as Municipal Treasurer, Burgos Ilocos Norte and THE ILOCOS NORTE COCONUT PRODUCERS ASSOCIATION, INC.

- vs -

HONORABLE RICARDO Y. NAVARRO, Judge of the Court of First Instance, Laoag City, Ilocos Norte, JOHN F. NORTHCOTT JR., and ROBERT PATRICK NORTHCOTT

That Petition likewise sought to annul the Amended Decision rendered by the lower Court.

On April 21, 1970, upon Motion for clarification by re-spondents NORTHCOTTS, this Court resolved to direct them to file a consolidated Answer to both Petitions.[2]

It bears emphasizing that G. R. Nos. L-31623 and L-31865 involve the same principal parties, the same Amended Decision in Civil Case No. 4235 of the lower Court, and the same cause of action, except that they were filed by different lawyers.

On February 23, 1971, this Court resolved:

"L-31865 (Pedro Cabildo, etc., et al., vs. Hon. Ricardo Y. Navarro, etc., et al.) and L-31623 (Ilocos Norte Coconut Producers Association vs. John F. Northcott, Jr., et al.). Petitioners in L-31865, having failed to file a reply brief within the period which expired on January 18, 1971, this case is hereby considered sub-mitted for decision WITHOUT SAID PETITIONERS' REPLY BRIEF. Case No. L-31623 is likewise submitted for decision, respondents having failed to file their brief within the period which expired on August 8, 1970."[3]

(Emphasis ours)

On March 5, 1971, this Court also issued a Resolution of the following tenor:

"L-31623 (Ilocos Norte Coconut Producers Association vs. John F. Northcott, Jr., et al.) and L-31865 (Pedro Cabildo, etc., et al. vs. Hon. Ricardo Y. Navarro, etc., et al.). – As prayed for by respondents John F. Northcott, Jr., et al., the resolution of February 23, 1971 is hereby RECONSIDERED and said respondents' prayer that the brief submitted by them in Case No. L-31865 be likewise considered as the brief for respondents in Case No. L-31623, is GRANTED."^[4] (Underlining supplied)

On August 8, 1973, the parties, assisted by their respective counsel, jointly filed a Motion to Approve Compromise Agreement and to consider the case terminated.^[5] It was filed in L-31865 and attached to the Rollo of that case only. In that Agreement, petitioner Ilocos Norte Coconut Producers Association and the NORTHCOTTS donated the entire land in litigation to the Provincial Government of Ilocos Norte, with the exception of 14 hectares which they retained in equal shares of 7 hectares each.

On August 30, 1973, the Provincial Board of Ilocos Norte took note of the aforesaid Compromise Agreement and expressed its gratitude to the parties for the donation of the land to the province.

In a Resolution promulgated on November 26, 1973, this Court decreed:

"ACCORDINGLY, the compromise agreement is approved, and the parties are hereby enjoined to comply faithfully with its terms. After this resolution shall have become final, let the record be remanded to the Court of First Instance of Ilocos Norte which is hereby ordered to hear and determine, on the basis of quantum meruit, the amount of the attorney's fee that may be due to Atty. Manuel V. San Jose. Let the corresponding lien be constituted upon the 7-hectare land retained by the respondents Northcotts under the deed of donation. No costs."^[6]

Inadvertently, the aforesaid Resolution was promulgated only in G. R. No. L-31865 and not in G. R. No. L-31623, so that the latter case has remained pending in the docket of this Court. In the meantime, in L-31865, the records were remanded on January 4, 1974 and entry of judgment made on November 29, 1976.

Considering, however, that the sole petitioner in G. R. No. L-31623 is also a petitioner in G. R. No. L-31865, and that the two cases have the same subject matter, and identical causes of action, it is plain to see that the Resolution of this Court of November 26, 1973, *supra*, covered and resolved the two cases. The intendment to consider them as consolidated is evident from the Resolutions dated April 21, 1970, February 23, 1971 and March 5, 1971, *supra*. The matter of the determination of attorney's fees is no obstacle to writing finish to this Petition as well, specially considering that the corresponding lien therefor has been constituted, and with the lapse of time, may have been settled to the satisfaction of the parties concerned.

ACCORDINGLY, let this case (G. R. No. L-31623) be, as it is hereby, declared terminated.

No costs.

SO ORDERED.

Teehankee, Acting C.J., Fernandez, Guerrero, and De Castro, JJ., concur.
Makasiar, J., is on leave.

[1] p. 44, Rollo.

[2] p. 50, *ibid*.

[3] p. 115, Rollo, G. R. No. L-31865

[4] p. 118, *ibid.*

[5] p. 120, *ibid.*

[6] pp. 150-154, *ibid.*

ABOUT BATAS.ORG

Study smarter at BATAS.org

The Philippine bar review and law-school companion built around how your brain actually remembers.

The complete Philippine law library - free for everyone.

More than 100,000 Supreme Court decisions, Republic Acts, and executive issuances - full-text searchable, browsable by category and year, and always free. No paywall, no login. This PDF came from it.

Audio case-brief lectures.

Any decision becomes a podcast-style lecture - facts, issues, ruling, and doctrine - with read-along highlighting and a hands-free presentation mode. Study while commuting, working out, or resting your eyes.

Bar review built on the science of memory.

Complete, sequenced courses for all eight bar subjects, narrated like podcasts and reinforced with retrieval practice and spaced review - the study techniques with the strongest evidence behind them.

The full law-school curriculum.

One subscription unlocks the entire J.D. curriculum - every subject, every lesson, with your progress tracked down to the paragraph so you can pick up exactly where you left off, on any device.

Mock exams that tell you where you stand.

Timed multiple-choice exams graded instantly, with per-subject score breakdowns and focus suggestions that point you at your weakest topics first.

A study planner that keeps you on pace.

Set your schedule and BATAS tells you every day whether you are on track for bar day - and exactly which lesson to take next.

Start free at <https://batas.org>

The law library is free forever - and your first lesson is one click away.

The text of this document is an official public record and remains in the public domain. Formatting, presentation, and compilation © 2026 batas.org.

Downloaded free from the batas.org Law Library. Share it freely - the library is free for every law student, bar reviewee, and practitioner.